Walking the Names: sensing presences and absences in a contested memory landscape

Richard S White PhD

Artist/Researcher. Senior Lecturer in Media Practice, School of Art, Film and Media, Bath Spa University, UK.

r.white2@bathspa.ac.uk

Abstract:

Walking the Names was a cycle of walks in a 'reluctant' site of memory in Bath (UK), 2019-21. Walkers read out the names of those who died of poverty in the C19th Workhouse and were buried on the site. As the project progressed, the Covid death toll mounted. A walking arts process is presented as slow activism, offering a participatory, corporeal, sensory engagement with landscape, power and memory.

Bath is a designated UNESCO World Heritage site. A National Lottery funded Landscape Partnership, Bathscape, seeks to articulate a vision for the city as a Landscape City. The paper explores *Walking the Names* as part of an emergence of uneasy memories, silenced voices and care in the contested spaces of Bath's memory landscape. Drawing on the vision of the Landscape City, reflecting on the city as 'wounded', the paper articulates a process for co-creative critical re-memorialisation, reclaiming absences and silenced memories.

Keywords: wounded city, walking-with, heritage, Landscape City

Preamble

Walking the Names reclaims an old burial ground (see Figure 1) as a site of memory as a contribution to processes of care and repair in an emergent Landscape City. This

article offers an exploration of a walking arts approach to activating landscape in Bath (UK) reflecting on reluctant sites of memory, alert to the epistemic harms represented by and embodied in such sites. Considering authorised presences and deliberate omissions by race and class in this context, I am urgently reminded of perspectives so easily obscured for me. I write as a privileged able–bodied man, racialised as white, I am still learning. This creative learning process draws on a more-than-representational approach engaging critically with landscape and power.

Figure 1: Bath Union Workhouse Burial Ground 2017. Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

Let us walk to the burial ground:

The winter sun shines low over an empty field, high at the city's edge, the sky is big, the space open, bleak. Sunlight on low mounds throws shadows into the hollows, the undulating surface appears to have no natural origin. A high stone wall closes off the view from the main road out of the city; a narrow tarmac path leads from a break in the wall towards a grey low rise block of flats. Viewed from a satellite one hot summer, Google shows this unnamed field strangely pock marked with rectangles of dry greens and ochre yellows slipping from a disturbed grid. On the ground in spring those same patterns are picked up in daisies and creeping buttercup; a solitary cowslip emerges from one of the hollows.

More than three thousand bodies are buried in Bath's Workhouse Burial Ground it does not merit designation on any recent official map, there are no gravestones, there is no formal memorial or description. Until recently the knowledge of the identity of this plot of still-consecrated land only survived in traces of local memory and fragments of archive.

Introduction

In this article I discuss *Walking the Names* through the lens of my research-creation practice attending to the wider contexts of Landscape City (e.g. de las Rivas Sanz & Sardá, 2014; Corner 2016; Grant 2018, 2021) and invoking the idea of caring for, and in, a 'wounded' city/site (Till 2008, 2011) as an opening towards social repair. I approach this from a more-than-representational perspective (e.g. Waterton 2014; Lorimer 2005; Thrift 2008; Drozdzewski et al 2016) informed by commentaries on affect (e.g. Wetherell 2012; Witcomb 2015; Smith and Campbell 2016; Ahmed 2010) and hauntology (e.g. Verwoert 2012; Zembylas 2013; Coverley 2020; Cloutier 2016; Fisher 2012). The 2019-21 project emerged from creative work on related heritage and social justice themes in Bath, notably the *Sweet Waters* walking project, concerning legacies of slave-ownership, discussed elsewhere (White 2020, 2019) *Walking the Names* continued through pandemic precautions and the two lock downs, it was underway during the international resurgence of Black Lives Matter following the murder of George Floyd and the toppling of a statue to a slave-trader in nearby Bristol.

I outline historical context and an intradisciplinary scaffolding before sampling the creative project. I discuss this as slow activism, a process of learning, care and social repair in a wounded city/site, concluding with some observations with regard to an emergent Landscape City. I co-hosted and curated *Walking the Names* in collaboration with writer and historian, John Payne, whose great-grandparents' bodies are buried in the field. We improvised strategies with a growing group of walkers towards enabling the unmemorialised dead and the conditions in which they died to come to mind and body. In a city landscape that denies its ghosts we are learning how to give their presence a voice; together we invoked a 'remembering that serves to illuminate and transform the present' (Massey 1994:171).

Historical context and conceptual frameworks overview

The New Poor Law and the end of slavery

At a time of unrest and dislocation, internal migration from rural work to industrial centres fuelled by wealth extracted from empire and plantation (Fowler 2020), an 1832 Royal Commission studied the condition of the casualties, the 'paupers'. The resulting Poor Law Amendment Act (1834) introduced the New Poor Law requiring parishes to pool resources, consolidating the provision of 'relief' to the poor into a single 'union' and house them in *Union* Workhouses. Bath's Union Workhouse opened in 1838 replacing the poor relief that had been provided by twenty-four local parishes. *Walking the Names* involved walking and reading the names of those who died in that workhouse in the latter half of the nineteenth century and whose bodies were buried in the field where we walked.

This New Poor Law aimed to bring to an end a system whereby those who were economically unproductive, unable to work or find work were supported in the community through 'outdoor relief'. The Union Workhouses centralised a system of 'indoor relief' in which those unable to support themselves, or be supported by family members, were brought 'indoors'. In these purpose-built buildings parents and children, men and women, boys and girls were separated from each other. Poverty, the inability to save for old age or care for a family member, was thus punished by incarceration and humiliation (Ball, Parkin and Mills, 2020:16; Payne 2020b).

The new system was designed as a cost effective solution to 'poor relief' and funded by local taxation on property owning residents of each parish. Union Workhouses were supervised by a local Board of Guardians implementing instructions

and rules set by the national Poor Law Commission. Workhouses were expected to become self-sufficient; a harsh regime was operated according to Commission instructions, the day regulated by the toll of a bell.

The New Poor Law was introduced at a time when changes in the English countryside including enclosures, farming methods and mechanisation exacerbated rural poverty whilst urban industrial centres offered a promise of work and wealth. In the same period wealth looted from an expanding empire and generated through the labour of captured and enslaved Africans had funded country houses and gardens, new urban architecture and was stimulating Britain's industrial base (Hall et al 2014; Fowler 2020). Recent research connects the changes wrought on the landscape of England at this time with this new wealth and the process that generated it (Perry 2013; Fowler 2020; Wills and Dresser 2020). In 1836 the status of enslaved was abolished in the western part of the British Empire and, as the poor were being warehoused in the new Workhouses, slave-owners benefitted from a further capital injection of £20m as 'compensation'. Former slave-owners in Britain were part of the property owning class upon whom the New Poor Law tax was levied; locally funded and managed they were able to exert pressure to reduce costs further (Ball et al 2020 p 15). Responsibility for the poor was transferred from church and charity into the hands of landowners and the state, nationally and locally, leaving a legacy embodied in land and buildings as well as the institutions of what became Britain's welfare state. (Ball et al 2020, Thompson 1968).

I contend that the spectre of slave-ownership haunts Britain's present day welfare state. It is beyond the scope of this article to develop this theorisation further, however the 'spectral moment' of the series of art works I have been hosting in Bath is about the resurgence of these 'ghosts', these 'revenants' (Zembylas 2013; Derrida 2012)

revealing the wounded landscape in which they are embodied. Only recently have these accounts of the past begun to be heard, questioning the sources of the wealth that shaped the urban landscape and produced the post-Enclosure landscape of England. The authorised heritage narrative of Britain and empire and its impact on identity, 'sense of place' and affective affiliation has been widely discussed (e.g. Hall 1999; Jones and Garde-Hansen 2012; Smith and Waterton 2009). *Walking the Names* took place in the context of a city that has remained officially silent on the sources of its wealth, the origins of its workforce and the burial places of its poor (Sobers 2020), this narrative contributes to a socially constructed amnesia, a silence (Martin 2013).

Bath Union Workhouse

Built to house six hundred people, within seven years the Bath Workhouse was already over capacity (Payne 2020b). As part of the regime of self-sufficiency the dead were buried on site; the *Bath Chronicle* of Thursday 29 Jul 1847 carried the following account:

> A half-past three o'clock, the Bishop proceeded to the Union Workhouse and consecrated a piece of ground for the interment of such poor persons as may die within the house. Thus the inconvenience of removing the bodies to different parishes will in future be obviated.

By 1858 over a thousand bodies had been interred in a plot adjacent to the main building and a further piece of land was bought and consecrated. This 'new' burial ground was the site for *Walking the Names*. Between 1858 and 1899 over three thousand bodies were buried, from babies a few days old to elders in their nineties, many recording their place of birth in rural villages.

Over the past hundred years former workhouses became hospitals and residential care homes and the lands they once occupied passed to the local authority

and the National Health Service. In Bath, the buildings have survived, as have the burial grounds, the 'new' burial ground is still owned by the local authority and the land is still consecrated.

Bath as a wounded city

Derrida's key work (2006) offers a widely applied conceptual framework theorising spectral presences. Till's related work attends to a landscape infused with the spectres of trauma, both share a concern for social justice. Till describes a 'wounded city' as,

> densely settled locales that have been harmed and structured by particular histories of physical destructions, displacement and individual and social trauma resulting from state-perpetrated violence (2011:6)

This definition may sound graphic for genteel Bath, but I suggest it fits. The dramatic growth of Bath as an elite location in the Eighteenth century coincided with the peak of the Atlantic slave trade and the flow of slave-generated wealth to England. The trade in captured and enslaved people and its connections with Bristol, the sea port further down the River Avon is well documented (e.g. Richardson 2005; Dresser 2007) as is Georgian Bath's development using the wealth generated (e.g. Knight 1978; Parker 2012; Perry 2013). This is barely present, however, in the stories the city tells about itself and to the world as a UNESCO designated World Heritage Site (e.g. Bath and North East Somerset Council 2019).

Whether it is through the othering practices of racialisation that diminish and erase historic Black presence in the City, practices of empire that conceal the sources and circumstances of the extraction of wealth or the practices of class privilege that force internal exile and penalise poverty, these practices continue to inflict epistemic injury. These are the injuries that constitute the wounded city, disabling residents and

visitors alike from fully knowing and becoming in this landscape. In this respect *Walking the Names* can be considered as a manifestation of ‘a place-based ethics of care’ (Till 2011) generating new knowings and empathy towards repair. The project brought to mind and body the ‘elusive remnants [of the past] that cannot be articulated in the languages available to us’ (Zembylas 2013:80)

Bath as Landscape City

Till suggests that in reaching towards an understanding of a city as wounded

> other imaginaries of place, temporality, and the city might focus attention on why places, peoples, groups, environments and non-human natures continue to be injured. (Till 2011: 5)

The emerging perspective of Bath as a Landscape City is one such imaginary of place reaching out to an engagement with the presences of humans, non-humans and affects in a living ecology (Adams and Larkham 2015; Rodrigo 2015). Landscape Architect, Andrew Grant argues that cities of the future should be defined by their living landscapes and their ‘human life support systems’ (2021). Landscape Cities, he suggests ’would help reconnect our culture, economy and wellbeing with global biodiversity and the health of the planet.’ Grant is chair of Bath’s Landscape Partnership, Bathscape, a National Lottery funded organisation dedicated to engaging more people in caring for and using the city landscape (Bathscape 2019). Bathscape references and is more or less contiguous with the UNESCO World Heritage Site in Bath. The initiative is focussed on the landscape of human and non-human ecologies locally, building relationships, networks and capacities towards a Landscape City. *Walking the Names* is a critical contribution to that project.

Materials and Methods: the walking and reading

Walking the Names emerged out of a series of radical walking arts projects in Bath, notably *Sweet Waters* (White 2018), 'sense-ing' legacies of slave-ownership. These projects manifest a desire to challenge injurious silences, contributing to the "'struggle of memory against forgetting'" (hooks cited in Massey 1994:171).

Walking the Names developed from a set of walks I had co-hosted with writer, John Payne. John shared the story of his ancestors, who, like many others who were to end up in the workhouse, had come to Bath from rural Somerset. We hosted several walks arising from his research on the Bath Union Workhouse, these walks in the Bathscape began to develop a psychogeographic alertness to the landscape of poverty, discovering, for example, a bus route along which at different stops life expectancy varied by as much as ten years (Bath and North East Somerset Council 2017). The walks offered at successive Bathscape Walking Festivals built knowledge and engagement, walkers joined us whose ancestors were buried in the field, others took part who lived locally and at least two walkers had been born in the workhouse building after it had become a hospital.

Steps to Heaven

In 2018 we presented the public walk, *Steps to Heaven*. A group of about twenty met at the site of the Board of Guardian's offices in central Bath. We walked up hill into mist and rain towards the former workhouse. Crossing the first burial site, close to the now permanently locked workhouse chapel, we stopped to acknowledge the thousand plus burials on this small site. Here much to the surprise of the walkers and especially those carrying the bluetooth speakers, Eddie Cochran's posthumous 1960 UK hit 'Three Steps to Heaven' burst out. The rock and roll hero had died in the old workhouse following a car crash. The group of walkers finally arriving at the burial field were

greeted by a group of folk musicians, wrapped in plastic capes, playing a lament. We stood in the damp, desolate, field listening to the music and reflecting on the rock and roll provocation. By 1960 the workhouse had become a hospital, there are two memorials outside the chapel, both to Eddie Cochran, his body is buried in California. The irony was not lost that the only person to have died in the workhouse and to have a memorial had not died of poverty and was not buried there. John read a closing poem as we sensed our bodies in the landscape and the remains of the three thousand plus beneath our feet.

Walking the Names: walking, listening, reading

The group who completed the walk in the rain in 2018 became the core participants in *Walking the Names*. Following *Steps to Heaven,* I pledged to host a regular monthly slow walk, progressively reading all the names of those buried in the field in the order of their burial. We were fortunate in discovering the digitised Burial Register, a small team had started transcribing from microfiche but digitisation made this immediately accessible. The group and the mailing list grew to over 70 individuals, a subgroup enthusiastically began trying to find more about the names we were reading. One member of that group has sustained this energy over the entire eighteen months of walking and reading and has tracked down life stories of nearly 40 of the names we have read. The research is gathered and shared on a project webpage (White 2019).

Initially we walked and read from the Register a year at a time and then gathered in the middle of the field where three stone markers poked through the turf. Some stones had been moved to the edge since my first site visit in 2015, the remaining three resisted the Council contractors preference to cut the grass in straight lines. We subsequently discovered that there may have been a memorial there to a workhouse chaplain ‘buried with his flock’, (The Gospel Magazine, 1865) but remembered by

some as a ‘home’ in childhood games of tag. Here at this resistant home we gathered, left flowers and tributes, sensed and discussed the ghosts, some offered poems and later we were to have music again. For many walkers, myself included, the Burial Ground was local, each time we walked a little more interest was stirred, some watched with curiosity, some joined in sharing family stories of an ancestors buried in the site or memories of the site itself. A walker reflects on the experience:

> Walking and reading the names on a regular basis over the last year in a ritualised way has been an extraordinarily powerful and moving experience for me. Reading the names out loud and stating the age of each adult and child has given them the humanity, respect and dignity denied them at their death. (Participant K: Walking the Names walkers 2021).

Covid…walking/reading from home and the ‘poor’ memorial

The lockdowns of 2020 and 2021 took the project into a different dimension, we were still allowed to walk, but alone and not at a great distance from home. Walkers were invited to record themselves and share the recording, these were layered with the sound of the workhouse bell and mixed to a single video and published to the webpage and social media (White 2019). This generated further interest and enabled remote participation.

Throughout lockdown individual walkers had been walking and reading on the site and the ‘three stones home’ had begun to evolve as a place of memorial. With the relaxation of Covid restrictions *Walking the Names* developed a further manifestation, walkers made and placed small flags with a name from the burial register near the three stones (see Figure 2). As Rodrigo (2015) notes, dates and names make powerful memorial connections; some chose to memorialise the babies buried in the field, others the elders or a family name or a personal date and those with a direct connection anticipated the reading of the name of an ancestor. We were welcoming in the names,

giving them a voice in a fluttering flag and a new emotional connection. The collection of small name flags, ribbons and pennants evolved, became a 'poor' memorial in the centre of the site renewed each month and often added to in the days in-between (see Figure 2). Month on month the field was re-embodied in this way, new layers of affect were sticking to this place (Ahmed 2010), we had begun to 'activate' the landscape (Abbott 2012).

Figure 2: Flags at the 'poor' memorial, 2020. Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

As the months passed the 'poor' memorial survived, and although it attracts the interest of visiting dogs, it has yet to be vandalised. Its only desecration was by the municipal grass cutting contractors, in the days before the flags, when they completely scalped it, provoking a social media storm. A new 'poor' memorial appeared almost instantly made by visitors with leaves and flowers using small stones to represent the names read. As the winter months approached there has been some guerrilla gardening of the memorial and as I write in March 2021, herbs and a yew tree sapling are growing alongside some spring flowers.

In our monthly practice walkers met at the three stones, here an orientation and dedication began each walk. This activity became a centring moment, an acknowledgment of buried ancestors and the time of the virus. At an appropriate moment, with the recording of the workhouse bell playing, walking and reading began. The invitation was to walk as slow as possible, with no further conversation until that reading was done.

Sound in the burial ground

The ringing of bells, music and any kind of wake was denied to those buried in the field; the playing of a recording of a bell tolling as the names of the dead were called

out was a spectral invocation. The bell was in fact the old Workhouse bell that had regulated the inmates' days. John had found it on mute display, its clapper removed, in the new hospital built in the grounds of the former workhouse, I made a field recording and mixed it on a loop to form a slow toll. In September 2020 the folk musicians who had greeted us that wet Sunday two years previously returned to make a poignant sonic contribution with an approximation of the music that might have been played at a village wake (see Figure 3).

Figure 3: Walkers listen to Bath City Waits 2020. Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

John recalls that afternoon,

> Resting on the ground towards the end of this session, I had the strange sensation (and I am not one given to fancy) of connection with the Workhouse Dead, including my own ancestors, When I thought about this later, it was as if the walking and reading had been an enactment of memorial, much more real and engaging with the dead than words on a plaque. (Payne 2021)

Walking the Names continued through the second lock down with a further iteration of recorded readings and field recordings presented as a locative media app on the Echoesxyz platform (White 2020). Networked distribution of films, soundscapes and app has extended the presence of the project and awareness of the Bath Union Workhouse and the fate of its inmates. It would be inaccurate to say that all walkers were fully engaged in the embodied slow walking experience, some were happy just to hear the names read and be there. Others were unsure about the flag making and 'poor' memorial, whilst others surprised themselves:

> At first I didn't get it, but having experienced it once I realised that this form of "witness" can be powerful (Participant B Walking the Names walkers 2021)

Discussion

Walking-with in the wounded city

Walking the Names is an iteration of an emergent and speculative *walking-with* approach developed over a number of projects (White 2018, 2019). The *walking-with* approach has been discussed and applied by other researchers (e.g. Sundberg 2013; Jeffries 2010; Kelly 2013; Springgay and Truman 2018). This walking and questioning approach generates critical learning and empathic dialogues through embodied experience and affective encounters, curated interventions, provocations and serendipity.

Sundberg locates *walking-with* as part of a process of unlearning privilege, alert to the voices and understandings that colonial, Eurocentric narratives have suppressed, 'locating our body-knowledge in relation to the existing paths we know and walk' (2013:39). This is a practice of social justice and repair, walking with other, spectral, imaginary, remembered human and non-human presences and absences.

Walking the Names is an iteration of slow activism in a wounded city, uneasy with its past; it enacted a caring practice opening the possibility of new understandings and repair. Till describes these practices as grounded in memory work and emerging from an understanding of the 'complex interface between bodies, memory, social groups and the lived city, and affect' (2011:9). With few descendants of the buried to refer to and minimal formal archival material and only fragments of family memory to work with, sensing and imagination were key tools. After eighteen months of regular walking, walkers' affective encounters and emotional attachment to the site are widely shared and demands for a more official recognition of the site are emerging. For some the organic, living 'poor' memorial is a materialisation of this. For many participants

the experience generated empathy as they reflected on lost lives, unheard stories and their critical resonances in the present.

> I come from a family that had to count every penny, when I was a child I knew never to ask for anything to eat if I took a friend home, there just wasn't anything to spare. I can easily see how, in the past, that could turn into not enough even for the family, not for a while but year after year, with the possibility of having to go into the Workhouse always and inevitably there. The Burial Ground is a reminder of lost hopes and it feels good to speak out the names. I sometimes have a fancy that they are listening as we slowly walk over their bones. (Participant F, Walking the Names walkers 2021)

Figure 4: Walking the Names, slow walking 2020. Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

Walking and stumbling

Moving slowly, sensing in a co-created sound scape (see Figure 4) induced a particular mindfulness and corporeal awareness:

> It is very difficult to walk so slowly. The ground is so uneven, it is easy to stumble especially when the grass is long and you can't see the bumps. It makes one very conscious of what is underneath and I do wonder how many times we have spoken aloud the name of the person we are just walking over. It must have happened. (Participant F, Walking the Names walkers 2021)

Massumi (2015) discusses walking as a controlled act of falling, in the stumble, the learned and embodied tension between corporeal vulnerability and unseen forces is momentarily pushed into present attention. The stumble many of us experienced was a powerful somatic moment in which the site terrain in some way both ‘wrong footed’ the walker and released/produced knowledge. Michael (2018) explores a similar emergent space regarding ‘mis-stepping’; for some who mis-stepped or stumbled on the

workhouse field it was an affective encounter, a speculative spectral encounter with the life of a deceased person whose name may have just been read.

Accepting precarity and vulnerability, walkers attuned to these moments and sensations of 'bare life' at the threshold of making sense (Thrift 2008:60). As involuntary action and reflex try to regain equilibrium, the body 'forces us to think about what is concealed from thought, life' (Deleuze 1989: 189). Extending this classic observation, Bennett argues that the 'affective encounter becomes the means by which thought proceeds and ultimately moves towards deeper truth' (2005:17). Walking slowly with the sounds of voices reading names, ages and dates to the sound of the tolling bell, a flow of involuntary sensations and affective thought turns towards empathy,

> I found walking very slowly particularly difficult especially in cold, wet weather, as was often the case! The difficulty I experienced - coldness, increasing stiffness, numbness of my joints added to the uncomfortableness of the whole experience, making me ponder and reflect more on the awful conditions on the misery and suffering of those who unfortunately ended up there, and how terribly sad and tragic that was and how very lucky I am. (Participant J, Walking the Names walkers 2021)

Through these diverse experiences empathic dialogues emerged around present personal, and social justice, concerns. Sumartojo and Graves observe that such 'disruptive intrusions of the past become part of how we perceive and come to understand our environments' (2018: 329). Levine suggest that the activity of 'bringing hidden stories and stories of place to the surface… transform[s] participants into story bearers' (2014:144). *Walking the Names* extends and harnesses this in sound and movement, regular and repeated participation and materialisations. This activity generated new embodied knowledge and understandings of the site, an extended

conversation reflecting a barely articulated informal shared custodial responsibility for the site. Affective resonances not limited by time generated a commitment to carry and retell the stories and call out the official custodians of the site, the holders of the silence.

Social justice resonances

An early walk was billed as, 'walking with questions of poverty, memory and social justice, considering how a city buries its past' (White 2019). As walkers testify, these conversations were rich and varied especially as the virus death toll mounted. A walker emailed his recording of names with this comment,

> By chance I'm on duty today so this was recorded on a break walking the grounds of [a local] Hospice: to me there is a contrasting continuity there.
> I needed to update my team on a few things today and talking about your project as a way of highlighting how important it is we keep going at this time. By keeping this history alive it has reached into the present day corona virus response in a way that would have been impossible without your efforts.
> (quote used with permission on website, White 2019

As the Covid pandemic took hold wider resonances emerged, the death toll in the state social care sector, effectively the successor institutions to the workhouses, was noted by some walkers:

> As we heard the daily news of increasing death tolls and the fact that so many Covid victims had to die alone resonated strongly with the project. Also the fact that Covid seems to disproportionately impact on disadvantaged groups struck a chord with those who ended up in the workhouse through no fault of their own, other than they were poor and had fallen on hard times with nowhere else to go.
> (Parrticipant J Walking the Names walkers 2021)

And perhaps reflecting on issues of memorialisation and privilege thrust into the news following the toppling of the nineteenth century statue to the slave trader, William Colston, in nearby Bristol.

> I see many similarities between these people and the many people who have died of Covid-19. The people who haven't been able to isolate because of their jobs and the need for money and their poor housing. Society is very quick to put up statues and plaques to the great and the good and very quick to ignore the people who do the jobs that allow us to be civilised. (Participant H Walking the Names walkers 2021)

Slow activism in a reluctant site of memory

The view that heritage undertakes cultural work, giving authority to the values of a particular social group is well established in Hall's seminal essay (1999). Through walking, questioning and sensing, iterations of *walking-with* engage with that critique and challenge the normalisation of authorised heritage narratives.

The complex and entangled relationships between emotion, memory, identity and place has been widely discussed (e.g: Massey 1994; Nora 1989; Jones and Garde-Hansen 2012 Crouch 2015). Referencing Nora's *lieux de memoire* (1989) and in the context of her work researching people of African descent in the twenty-first century, Otele proposes 'reluctant sites of memory' (2016:2), with regard to the inadequate memorialisation of key locations of the slave trade. Otele describes spaces as 'reluctant' where memory and memorialisation is prevented, denied or impeded. Bath's Royal Crescent and other architectural features of the City of Bath are such reluctant sites of memory, offering no invitation to reflect on or even know the source of the wealth. Bath's slave-owning and colonial past hides in plain sight, just as the turf of the Workhouse field barely conceals what lies beneath. This is not to suggest a parallel in the atrocities of forced migration and chattel enslavement with the experience of

internal exile, poverty, death and pauper burial, it is, however, to point towards the wounds of the city and their intersectional spectral resonances.

Wounds in the Landscape City

Walking the Names presents a process of opening to an understanding and repair of the epistemic injury, invoking other ways of knowing. Sensing ever-present ghosts and seeking to learn from them the process draws out 'forgotten', silenced, unheard and subaltern accounts. Despite the punitive erasures by past authorities that continued into the period of the project, *Walking the Names* reclaimed a field as a space of memory from official amnesia and punitive oblivion. UK burial grounds are typically recognised by gravestones and memorials, places where family members, descendants and others might grieve, show respect and remember, and where the elite, even in death, manifest their wealth. The formalised design and landscape architecture of the burial grounds of the late Victorian period (eg Highgate Cemetery, London, Arnos Vale, Bristol and Bath Abbey Cemetery) evidence a particular cult of conspicuous, public mourning and memorialisation. In contrast, the Workhouse regime, of the same period, denied a dignifying 'decent burial' to those who died of poverty (Ball, Parkin and Mills 2020). This denial of a ritualised witnessing and a memorialised 'last resting place' forms part of the affective punishment for being poor and the wounding of the place. In the context of the Covid pandemic it resonates in the difficulties placed around the witnessing of the passing and burial of a loved one and the wider social inequalities the death toll revealed.

Unlike Arnos Vale Cemetery where non human elements, notably the trees have been agents in transforming the site and making it a distinctive, loved, memorable place (Cloke and Jones 2004), the Bath Union Workhouse burial ground has, until recently, been municipally anonymised. The grass is cut in lines, some token tree planting has

taken place at the perimeter. Between cuts in the wide central space, however, smaller plants, grasses and wild flowers resist and bloom, revealing settling earth and the rectilinear outlines of burials. Noticing this resistance, sensing presences, becoming alert to slower interactions, welcoming and encouraging them is core to this place–based practice of care.

De las Rivas Sanz and Sard (2014) describe design for the Landscape City as drawing on nonmodern understandings enabling humans and non-humans to find connection and be part of a living world. This reimagining of the city, in their view, draws on indigenous pre-Columbian influences and can be contextualised in Till's theorising of the city from a post colonial perspective (Till 2012:6). Grant (2021) invites us to imagine a city that is defined not by its buildings but by its ecology and offers Bath/Bathscape as an emergent model. This vision involves engaging people and activating their senses, renewing alertness to the sacred and spectral that De las Rivas Sanz and Sard refer to (2014). *Walking the Names* and other *walking-with* interventions offer a somatic approach mobilising the stickiness of affects (Ahmed 2010) through which social repair in the wounded city might begin and from which Bath as Landscape City might emerge.

Conclusion

Realising Bath as a Landscape City involves a recognition of the city as a wounded place and an activation of the place-based ethic of care emerging through *Walking the Names* at the Workhouse Burial Ground. Strategies for living with the ghosts of the atrocities of empire are urgently needed as their legacies emerge. *Walking the Names* offers a co-creative and non-confrontational attempt to begin that process contributing to an active sense of response-ability and belonging.

Walking the Names demonstrated an attuning to, and manifestation of the 'intimate relationships' people have with wounded places (Till 2008). The *walking-with* approach invoking multiple ways of knowing has enabled the burial ground to speak, to become a site of memory and reflection, a place where the ghosts are welcome. *Walking the Names* is part of a wider activist challenge to the exclusion of questions of race and class in the dominant narrative of the city, thereby offering a contribution to the reframing of Bath as a Landscape City.

Acknowledgements:

I would like to acknowledge Dr John Payne for his support and commitment to the development and delivery of *Walking the Names* and all the walkers who took part in the project for their many and diverse contribution.

Notes on Contributor

Richard S White is an artist-researcher based in the West of England. His creative work is an emergent speculative hybrid of media making and somatic practice. Recent work explores how embodied practice might enable access to uncomfortable histories and reluctant heritages. Portfolio: www.walknowtracks.co.uk

ORCiD: **0000-0002-7421-7507**

References

Abbott, M. (2012). Activating landscape. *Landscape Review, 14*(1), pp. 24-26.

Adams, D., & Larkham, P., J. (2016). Walking with ghosts of the past: Unearthing the value of residents' urban nostalgias. *Urban Studies, 53*(10), pp. 2004-2022.

Ahmed, S. (2010). Happy objects. In M. Gregg, & G. Seigworth J. (Eds.), *The affect theory reader*, pp. 29-51. Duke University Press.

anon. (1865). The workhouse chaplain. *The Gospel Magazine.* p. 458.

Ball, R., Parkin, D., & Mills, S. (2020). *100 Fishponds Road: Life and death in a Victorian workhouse.* Bristol Radical History Group.

Bath and North East Somerset Council. (2017). *Joint wellbeing strategy* https://www.bathnes.gov.uk/sites/default/files/joint_health_wellbeing_strategy.pdf (accessed 10/1/19)

Bath & North East Somerset Council. (2019). *City of Bath World Heritage Site.* www.bathworldheritage.org.uk. https://www.bathworldheritage.org.uk/ (accessed 10/1/19)

Bathscape. (2019). *Bathscape.* bathscape.co.uk. https://www.bathscape.co.uk/ (accessed 21/10/21)

Bennett, J. (2005). *Empathic vision: Affect, trauma and contemporary art*. Stanford University Press.

Cloke, P., & Jones, O. (2004). Turning in the graveyard: Trees and the hybrid geographies of dwelling, monitoring and resistance in a Bristol cemetery. *Cultural Geographies, 11*, pp. 313-341.

Cloutier, G. (2016). An A/r/tographic inquiry of a silenced first nation ancestry, hauntology, G(hosts) and art(works): An exhibition catalogue. *International Journal of Education & the Arts, 17*(30), pp.1-31.

Corner, J. (2016). *Landscape city.* Landscape Architecture Foundation. https://www.lafoundation.org/resources/2016/07/declaration-james-corner (accessed 9/4/21)

Coverley, M. (2020). *Hauntology: Ghosts of futures past*. Oldcastle Books.

Crouch, D. (2015). Affect, heritage, feeling. In E. Waterton, & S. Watson (Eds.), *The Palgrave handbook of Contemporary Heritage Research* pp. 177-190. Palgrave Macmillan.

De las Rivas Sanz, Juan Luis, & Sardá, J. M. (2014). Landscape city: Nature and urban regeneration in american cities. *Bitácora Arquitectura, 28*, pp. 67-79.

Deleuze, G. (1989). *Cinema 2 the time image*. Athlone Press.

Derrida, J. (2006). *Specters of Marx: The state of debt, the work of mourning and the new international*. Routledge.

Dresser, M. (2007). *Slavery obscured: The social history of the slave trade in Bristol.* Redcliffe Press.

Drozdzewski, D., De Nardi, S., & Waterton, E. (2016). Geographies of memory, place and identity: Intersections in remembering war and conflict. *Geography Compass, 10*(11), pp.447-456.

Fisher, M. (2012). What is hauntology? *Film Quarterly, 66*(1), pp.16-24.

Fowler, C. (2020). *Green unpleasant land: Creative responses to rural England's colonial connections.* Peepal Tree Press.

Grant, A. (2021) *Landscape cities.* Unpublished manuscript.

Grant, A. (2018). *Landscape cities tedx talk.* You Tube Tedx Bath. https://www.ted.com/talks/andrew_grant_landscape_cities (accessed 22/7/21)

Hall, C., Draper, N., McClelland, K., Donington, K., & Lang, R. (2014). *Legacies of British slave-ownership: Colonial slavery and the formulation of victorian Britain*. Cambridge University Press.

Hall, S. (1999). Whose heritage? un-settling 'the heritage', re-imagining the post-nation. *Third Text, 49*(13), pp. 3-13.

Jeffries, F. (2010). "Asking we walk": The Zapatista revolution of speaking and listening. In K. Howley (Ed.), *Understanding community media*, pp. 348-357. Sage.

Jones, O. & Garde-Hansen, J. (2012). *Geography and memory: Explorations in identity, place and becoming*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Kelly, S. (2013). 'Asking, we walk'. In P. Lichtenfels, & J. Rouse (Eds.), *Performance, politics and activism*, pp. 107-120. Palgrave Macmillan.

Knight, D. (1978). *Gentlemen of fortune: The men who made their fortunes in Britain's slave colonies.* Frederick Muller Ltd.

Levine, P. (2014). On common ground - here as there. In J. Farman (Ed.), *The mobile story: Narrative practices with locative technologies* pp 143-158. Routledge.

Lorimer, H. (2005). Cultural geography: The busyness of being 'more-than-representational'. *Progress in Human Geography, 29*(1), pp 83-94.

Martin, B. (2013). Immaterial land. In E. Barrett, & B. Bolt (Eds.), *Carnal knowlege towards a 'new materialism' through the arts*, pp. 185-204. I.B.Taurus.

Massey, D. (1994). *Space, place and gender*. Polity Press.

Massumi, B. (2015) *Politics of Affect.* Polity Press.

Michael, M. (2018). Walking, falling, telling. the anecdote and the mis-step as a 'research event'. In C. Bates, & A. Rhys-Taylor (Eds.), *Walking through social research*, pp. 128-143. Routledge.

Nora, P. (1989). Between memory and history: Les lieux de mémoire. *Representations, 26*, pp7-24.

Otele, O. (2016). *Slavery and visual memory: What Britain can learn from France.*

Parker, M. (2012). *The Sugar Barons*. Windmill Books.

Payne, J. (2020b). *Workhouse to Hospital.* Bath Union Workhouse Burial Ground Memorial Group

Payne, J. (2021). *Reflections on walking the names* unpublished note shared with author

Perry, V. (2013). Slavery and the sublime: The Atlantic trade, landscape aesthetics and tourism. In Dresser, M & Hann, A. (Eds.), *Slavery in the British Country House,* pp. 98-105. English Heritage.

Richardson, D. (2005). Slavery and Bristol's 'Golden age'. *Slavery and Abolition, 26*(1), pp. 35-54.

Rodrigo, R. (2015). Making public pasts: Cultural dialogue and negotiation in public space. *Landscape Review, 15*(2), pp. 32-42.

Smith, L., & Waterton, E. (2009). 'The envy of the world?': Intangible heritage in England. In L. Smith, & N. Akagawa (Eds.), *Intangible heritage*, pp. 289-302. Routledge.

Smith, L., & Campbell, G. (2016). The elephant in the room: Heritage, affect, and emotion. In W. Logan, N. Craith Máiréad & U. Kockel (Eds.), *A companion to heritage studies*. pp. 443-460. John Wiley and Sons.

Sobers, S. (2020) Colonial complexity in the British landscape: An African-centric autoethnography. In S. De Nardi, H. Orange, S. High & E. Koskinene-Koivisto (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of memory and place*, pp. 42-51. Routledge.

Springgay, S., & Truman, S., E. (2018). *Walking methodologies in a more-than-human world: Walking lab*. Routledge.

Sumartojo, S., & Graves, M. (2018). Rust and dust: Materiality and the feel of memory at camp des milles. *Journal of Material Culture, 23*(3), pp.328-343.

Sundberg, J. (2013). Decolonizing posthumanist geographies. *Cultural Geographies, 21*(1), pp. 33-47.

Thompson, E. P. (1968). *The making of the English working class*. Penguin.

Thrift, N. (2008). *Non-representational theory: Space, politics, affect.* Routledge.

Till, K. E. (2008). Artistic and activist memory-work: Approaching place-based practice. *Memory Studies, 1*(1), pp. 99-113.

Till, K. E. (2011). Wounded cities: Memory-work and a place-based ethics of care. *Political Geography, 31*, pp. 3-14.

Verwoert, J. (2012). Living with ghosts: From appropriation to invocation in contemporary art//2007. In I. Farr (Ed.), *Memory*, pp. 146-155. Whitechapel Gallery/MITPress.

Waterton, E. (2014). A more-than-representational understanding of heritage? the 'past' and the politics of affect. *Geography Compass, 8*(11), pp. 823-833.

Wetherell, M. (2012). *Affect and emotion: A new social science understanding*. SAGE.

Witcomb, A. (2015). Thinking about others through museum and heritage. In E. Waterton, & S. Watson (Eds.), *The Palgrave handbook of contemporary heritage research*, pp. 130-143. Palgrave Macmillan.

Wills, M., & Dresser, M. (2020). *The impact of transatlantic slavery on England's built environment: A research audit.* English Heritage.

Walking the Names walkers. (2021). *Walking the Names* survey, authors research.

White, R. S. (2020). *Bath Workhouse Burial Ground: Walking the Names.* Echoesxyz. https://explore.echoes.xyz/collections/frZzWQxkxyJXa7VZ (accessed 15/1/21)

White, R. S. (2019). *Workhouse Walks. https://www.walknowtracks.co.uk/workhouse-walks.html* (accessed 15/11/21)

White, R. S. (2018). *Sweet Waters. https://www.walknowtracks.co.uk/sweet-waters.html* (accessed 15/11/21)

White, R. S. (2020). Breaking silences and revealing the disappeared: Walking-with legacies of slave-ownership in Bath (UK). *International Journal of Education through Art, 17*(2), pp 69-101.

Zembylas, M. (2013). Pedagogies of hauntology in history education: Learning to live with the ghosts of disappeared victims of war and dictatorship. *Educational Theory, 63*(1), pp. 69-86.

Figure captions:

Figure 1: *Bath Union Workhouse Burial Ground 2017.* Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

Figure 2: *Flags at the 'poor' memorial, 2020.* Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

Figure 3: *Walkers listen to Bath City Waits 2020.* Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.

Figure 4: *Walking the Names, slow walking 2020.* Documentary photograph. Courtesy of author.